Draft Work Plan Summary

Subgroup 6: Indirect Effects of Other Fuels

Presented to the LCFS Expert Workgroup
April 8, 2010
Sacramento, CA

Subgroup 6 Membership

• John Courtis, ARB Staff
• Blake Simmons, Sandia (Subgroup Chair)
• Bob Larson, EPA (Subgroup Co-chair)
• Seth Myers, University of Missouri
• Wally Tyner, Purdue University
• Phil Heirigs, Chevron Global Downstream LLC
• Jesper Kløverpris, Novozymes A/S
• Paul Wuebben, South Coast Air Quality Management District
Subgroup 6 Overarching Principles

- All fuels have direct and indirect effects from an economic, resource, and carbon perspective as a function of scale and intensification
- Need to establish a fundamental understanding of potential indirect effects as a function of fuel type
- Need to have robust attribution of indirect effects, causality, and validated models to calculate carbon values
- Should not be limited solely to GTAP and GREET
- Analyses need to be data driven and vetted with empirical data sets whenever possible
- Carbon scoring under LCFS should include direct and indirect effects for all fuels

Task 1: Establish Criteria for Defining “Indirect Effects of Other Fuels”

- Non-land indirect effects should be included for all fuels under the LCFS scoring system
- Prepare a criterion for indirect effects not considered under GTAP and CARB WTW GREET-based models as a function of fuel type
- Identify alternative modeling approaches
- Identify potential changes to current fossil fuel mixes in CA as a function of time
### Task 2: Develop a List of Indirect Effects to be Assessed

- Develop a prioritized list of possible indirect effects as a function of fuel type and scale

- Include non-corn ethanol biofuel pathways
  - Lignocellulosic biofuels
  - Algal biofuels

- Non-biofuel approaches – examples:
  - Gasoline/diesel
  - BEVs + Hybrids
  - Natural gas
  - Electricity
  - Hydrogen

### Task 3: Identify Significant Gaps in Current Indirect Effect Analyses

- Evaluate current LCFS indirect effect scores
- Evaluate current modeling approaches in terms of assumptions and data sets
- Develop a list of gaps under the current approaches
- Develop a prioritized list of indirect effects as a function of fuel type
Task 4: Identify Available Data Sets and Models for Indirect Effects as a Function of Fuel Type

- Evaluate publically available, validated data sets
- Evaluate models capable of processing current data sets
- Determine suitability of current modeling approaches for LCFS
- Develop a prioritized list of targets in terms of data sets and models that should be considered by ARB for LCFS inclusion

Task 5: Develop a Long-Term Work Plan for the ARB and LCFS

- Establish goals and work plans associated with addressing gaps that are present
- Identify different modeling approaches
- Identify critical metrics/data sets
- Identify high-priority indirect effects for all fuels under the LCFS
- Establish suggested resources/research groups to carry out work plan
Subgroup 6 Milestones

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Goal</th>
<th>Deadline</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Task 1</td>
<td>Establish Criteria for Defining Indirect Effects of Other Fuels</td>
<td>May 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Task 2</td>
<td>Develop a List of Indirect Effects to be Assessed</td>
<td>June 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Task 3</td>
<td>Identify Significant Gaps in Current Indirect Effect Analyses</td>
<td>July 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Task 4</td>
<td>Identify Available Data Sets and Models for Indirect Effects as a Function of Fuel Type</td>
<td>September 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Task 5</td>
<td>Develop a Long-Term Work Plan for the ARB and LCFS</td>
<td>October 2010</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Initial List of Proposed Technical Advisors/Additional Resources

- Tiax (Mike Johnson or Jennifer Pont)
- Mark Delucci, UC-Davis
- Michael Wang, Argonne
- Patricia Monihan, UCS
- John Sheers, CEERT
- Dan Kammen, UC-Berkeley
- Robert Sawyer, UC-Berkeley
- Alan Lloyd, ICCT
- Jim McMahon, LBNL
- Dawn Manley, Sandia
- Heather Johnson, EBI
- Brooke Coleman, New Fuels Alliance
- Björn Pieprzyk, Energy Research Architecture
- Norbert Kortläke, Energy Research Architecture
- Paula Rojas Hilje, Energy Research Architecture
- Other modeling groups at research institutions
- Experts in the field of indirect effects
- Energy sector experts