

## AB 32 Environmental Justice Advisory Committee

### Community Workshop

Location: Sacramento, CA

Date: March 1, 2017

#### Committee Member Hosts and Attendees

Colin Bailey, Katie Valenzuela Garcia

#### Air Resources Board (ARB) and State Agency Attendees

Trish Johnson, Floyd Vergara, Rajinder Sahota, Jason Gray, Wes Ingram, Mark Sippola, Jose Saldana, Ambreen Afshan, Stephanie Kato, Stanley Young, Veronica Eady, Phillip Dube, Wilde Ngalekassaga, Jason Meggs

Dan Woo, California Department of Public Health (CDPH)

#### CCP Note-taking Support

Justin Almase-Ruschell

#### Materials

Meeting information available at: <http://www.arb.ca.gov/ejac>

[Sacramento Community Meeting Flyer](#)

[ARB Overview Slides](#)

[Draft Cross Link of EJAC Recommendations to Proposed Scoping Plan](#)

#### Attachments

Appendix A: List of attendees

#### Welcome, Introductory Statements and Overview

**Katie Valenzuela Garcia**, Environmental Justice Advisory Committee (EJAC) member, opened the workshop, thanked all for attending and invited introductions around the room. Ms. Valenzuela Garcia then informed attendees of the agenda for the evening, highlighting the four World Café work stations of Natural and Working Lands, Water, Transportation and Energy. Finally, Ms. Valenzuela Garcia introduced Trish Johnson, ARB, for her presentation overviews the current status of the Scoping Plan.

#### Air Resources Board Overview of the Proposed Scoping Plan

Trish Jonson presented an overview of the status of the Proposed Scoping Plan. Ms. Johnson's presentation slides can be found here: [ARB Overview Slides](#).

#### Environmental Justice Advisory Committee Process Review

**Katie Valenzuela Garcia and Colin Bailey** provided an overview of the EJAC's process in relation to Assembly Bill (AB) 32. Ms. Valenzuela Garcia informed attendees that the process began in December, 2015, when the EJAC submitted a letter requesting the Final Scoping Plan be

released in June, 2017. She then recounted the series of EJAC ARB meetings as well as the series of EJAC community meetings which have been conducted to date, and invited attendees to submit requests for additional community meetings to Colin Bailey, Trish Johnson, or herself.

Ms. Valenzuela Garcia then presented material highlighting EJAC's recommendations to ARB, and how the recommendations reflected what was heard in the previous community workshops, including the workshop in Sacramento in July, 2016. Ms. Valenzuela Garcia and Mr. Bailey then presented material highlighting which EJAC recommendations are in the Proposed Scoping Plan, and which EJAC recommendations are not, as a platform for the four World Café stations to begin their discussions. Ms. Valenzuela Garcia acknowledged that not all EJAC recommendations made it into the Proposed Scoping Plan, and encouraged attendees to prioritize, to the best of their ability, which outstanding EJAC recommendations need to be incorporated into the Proposed Scoping Plan, as well as any new recommendations for the EJAC to deliver to ARB.

Regarding process, Ms. Valenzuela Garcia emphasized the following elements the EJAC remains focused on in its communication with ARB related to the EJAC recommendations: **Partnership:** The EJAC aims to build a true partnership with ARB, to provide the most impacted Environmental Justice (EJ) Communities with a real voice and input. **Equity:** The EJAC aims to provide the most impacted EJ communities with greater resources and faster reductions in pollutants than those experienced to date. **Coordination:** The EJAC aims to help foster a deeper commitment across state agencies with ARB to work successfully in implementing goals. **Economic Opportunities:** The EJAC aims is to see the "Just Transition" model implemented to target new job growth in the most impacted EJ communities. **Long-term Vision:** The EJAC aims to take the next seven generations of residents in EJ communities into consideration as it works towards implementation of its recommendations and the goals of the Scoping Plan.

Ms. Valenzuela Garcia described the materials provided which demonstrate how to track EJAC Recommendations in the Proposed Scoping Plan. Those recommendations that appear in bold have not yet been incorporated into the Proposed Scoping Plan, and those recommendations that do not appear in bold are incorporated to some degree. She stressed that the EJAC remains engaged in dialogue with ARB as it pushes for further incorporation. She also emphasized that the EJAC seeks data and metrics from ARB related to the Proposed Scoping Plan, in order to identify, for example, if the Proposed Scoping Plan is on track to meet the 2022 target.

Ms. Valenzuela Garcia and Mr. Bailey then introduced the four break-out topics for discussion at the "World Café" stations, and encouraged attendees to visit as many of the stations as they could, in order to offer meaningful input and discussion for both the EJAC and ARB.

## World Café Station Discussions

Utilizing a World Café style format, which encourages diversity of thought and ideas, stakeholders engaged in four 15-minute rounds of small group breakout conversations organized by four Sector/Topic tables. Participants were free to select which Sector discussion to participate in. At the transition, participants were allowed to remain at the same topic table or choose a new one.

The Sector/Topic tables were as follows:

1. Energy
2. Transportation
3. Water
4. Natural and Working Lands

## Energy Discussion Highlights, Suggestions and Concerns:

- Retrofit homes for greater energy efficiency.
  - Retrofit the energy program for mobile homes.
  - Move from tying incentives to home weatherization and transition to connecting them with the land instead. Some eligible homeowners do not want to be incentivized.
- Provide homeowners with greater access to grants.
  - A Sacramento ordinance supports these activities.
- The State should offer funding for regions that are not *required* to reduce Green House Gases (GHGs), but strive to do so anyway in their metropolitan area.
- Northern California does not have any metro planning areas, Disadvantaged Communities (DACs), or Green House Gas Reduction Funds (GGRF).
  - The State should utilize regional targeting of legislation to redirect Green House Gas Reduction Funds (GGRF).
  - Lower income households should qualify for GGRF support.
- Look to create smaller biofuel facilities for the Sierra region.

## Transportation Discussion Highlights, Suggestions and Concerns:

- Enhancing the transportation infrastructure can be the building block for growth.
  - This needs to include *smarter* urban planning related to transportation.
- Increase the percentage of the Active Transportation Program (ATP) funding in DACs.
  - Provide funding to purchase bikes in and for DACs. This would accomplish the EJAC's goal of increased health equity.
  - Dedicate true bike lanes in DACs. This will increase safety and perceived safety and increase the number of bikers within DACs.
- There is room to expand light rail in the Scoping Plan.
  - Cleanliness and crime are concerns in Sacramento's light rail system.
- DACs should receive prioritized transit funding within the Scoping Plan.

- Improve bus stops, and increase the number of buses in DACs.
- Smarter transit, and increased competition (privatized vs. public) would increase ridership.
  - Privatizing transit may not benefit DACs.
- A bullet train should service the Sacramento area.
  - Expanding the Capitol Corridor train would be beneficial as well.
  - Reducing Amtrak rider costs would benefit DACs.
- The high speed rail project should look to invest in businesses of color. This would accomplish the EJAC's goal of increased equity.
- Prioritize increased access to Zero Emissions Vehicles (ZEVs) for lower income households.
  - Increase the number of electric car charging stations in DACs.
  - Enhance the secondary market for fuel efficient vehicles in DACs.
  - Introduce partnerships with Lyft and Uber in DACs: The driver's first \$200 earned weekly goes to the company, and the driver keeps anything over \$200 earned from driving each week.
- Incentivize the State's buyback program of high emissions vehicles in DACs.
  - This plan is already happening within ARB in the Low Carbon Transportation Investments (LCTI) program.
- Increase *Trade Education* in DACs.
  - Offer a student loan forgiveness or rebate program for professional time spent working in DACs.
  - Leverage existing relationships with community colleges in DACs; ARB has committed to a pilot program to achieve this goal.
  - This benefits employers and employees and should be promoted at the high school level.
- Limit driving miles for trash haulers.
  - Charge more for excess miles driven to landfills outside the region.
  - This may relate to the social cost component of [AB 197](#).
- Decarbonize freight; move to make trucks more electric.
  - Infrastructure needs to be built for this.
  - Capture "lost energy" from trucks along roadways and send it to DACs.

#### Water Discussion Highlights, Suggestions and Concerns:

- This sector cites plans that will not deliver stated GHG reductions.
- Focus on gray water programs in DACs.
- Sequester carbon in meadows in the Sierra's to promote tree growth and sequestration.
- Enhance water management storage to slow water in times of high flow.
- Forest thinning helps with loss related to evapotranspiration.
- Consider net carbon loss: near-term loss leads to long-term gain.
- Recognize the positive impact to water percolation.
- Ensure communities (Sierra) benefit from water measures, including economic impacts.

- Recognize sector connections and the close ties of water and Natural and Working Lands.
- Re-train the landscaping industry.
  - For example, use fewer gas leaf blowers, transition to low water use plants, and maintain fewer lawns.
  - Introduce a jobs program for lower carbon landscape practices.
  - Increase rebates and incentives for landlords on rental properties for low water usage landscaping.
- Assess the impact on local and natural food sources from poor water management and the associated emissions from travel.
- Increase reservoir capacity and conservation to reduce energy related to conveyance.
- Evaluate household rainwater storage.
- Consider composting household (human) waste as a water savings measure.
- Improve the energy use needs of water treatment technologies.
  - This area requires greater funding for research and development.
- Develop sanitary sewer methane capture systems.
- Recognize the pollution prevention connection to downstream energy reduction.
- Focus on upper water management and storage.
- Improve the water rights system.
- Decrease carbon and energy downstream via remediation at the source of contamination.
- Enhance household leak loss detection measures (post meter), especially in older communities.
- Consider reforming the pricing component of Proposition 218.
- Address legacy contamination from old mining activities for both surface and groundwater, as well as sediment downstream.
- Improve maintenance of existing State reservoirs (sediment removal) to increase the capacity for renewable energy production.
  - Remove silt.
  - Compare costs for this undertaking with the costs of building new concrete dams and associated costs of concrete production and GHG emissions.
  - Quantify methane in silt and methane production in silt dams.
- Use existing programs to drive further research.

#### Natural and Working Lands Discussion Highlights, Suggestions and Concerns:

- Research local land commission issues, emphasizing biomass issues.
- Wood chipping is not sufficient in the Sierra Nevada regions.
- Trees are dying.
- Health and climate risks exist.
- Small scale biomass removal is acceptable and is a benefit to the renewable energy sector.
  - Promotes jobs and addresses poverty.

- Locate biomass plants in forests, rather than hauling trees elsewhere to burn. People with existing breathing issues suffer from nearby burning.
- The Nevada City biomass task force is a working example of this concept.
- In the current drought, dead and dying trees should be left in the forests, rather than transporting them elsewhere.
  - Middle ground may be for industry to manage the land.
  - Harvested trees should be used for and in farm soil.
- Improve interaction with the Federal Government, specifically the Bureau of Land Management (BLM), for funding opportunities.
- Generate a forest carbon plan.
- Assess acreage by County.
- This sector addresses the public health concerns of the other sectors, as well as job growth and the overall economic health of communities.
- Rural and urban areas must communicate more effectively with each other to achieve improvements.
- The [Alliance of Regional Collaboratives for Climate Adoption](#) (ARCCA) provides an opportunity to convene conversations related to water supply challenges and solutions.
- Auburn has a pilot scale facility working with renewable natural gas.
- The Sierra Nevada Conservancy Watershed is already working with the Federal Government, the State and Tribes on these and other matters.
- Need to further define DACs.
  - CES does not consider poverty.
  - The definition needs to be broadened in the Natural and Working Lands sector.
- Air pollution travels to rural communities.

### **Closing Comments**

Ms. Valenzuela Garcia and Mr. Bailey closed the meeting by inviting attendees to share their final thoughts and takeaways from the evening.

Attendees were invited to participate in the EJAC ARB Statewide Webinar in Sacramento on March 22, 2017.

Attendees were invited to submit further comments and concerns to the EJAC or ARB directly via the AB 32 Scoping Plan Webpage: <https://www.arb.ca.gov/cc/scopingplan/scopingplan.htm>

## Appendix A: List of Attendees

The following list only includes those participants that signed in, not all entered their names in the attendee list.

Steve Frisch  
Jonathan Kusel  
Claudia Espinvec  
Judy Robinson  
Diana Madson  
Payton Hagyard  
Mark Wilson  
John Deeter  
Valerie Bane  
David Hildebrand  
Rae Vander Werk  
Kendra Bridges  
Molly Wright

Amy Mmagret  
Vincent Valdez  
Beau Reynolds  
Ashley Tipping  
Angela Tillotson  
Ralph Propper  
Jesus Fores  
Sam Diaz  
Monti Hall  
Jackie Cole  
Chris Brown  
C.T. Wenk